

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission
Taliesin West, Board Room
12621 N. Frank Lloyd Wright Blvd.
March 10, 2005
6:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order in the Board Room at 6:00 P.M. following the walking tour of Taliesin West from 5:00 P.M. to 6:00 P.M. with Arnold Roy.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair

B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
Cathy Johnson, Commissioner
George Hartz, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

Absent: Nancy Dallett, Commissioner

Staff: Don Meserve
Bob Cafarella

Also Present: Arnold Roy

ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

MINUTES

February 10, 2005

Commissioner Hartz inquired about the number of people at the last public hearing. Mr. Meserve replied there were more people in attendance than spoke but he did not take a head count.

Commissioner Winslow made a motion to approve the minutes of the February 10, 2005 meeting as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gonzales and passed unanimously 6-0.

DESIGNATION OF TALIESIN WEST

Chair Wimmer thanked Mr. Roy for the walking tour of Taliesin and their gracious hospitality.

Arnold Roy, Vice President, Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, reported part of the agreement for the funds from the City of Scottsdale to the Foundation was to list Taliesin West on the Scottsdale Historic Register and we have started that process. He further reported that he first arrived here in 1952 as a young apprentice.

Commissioner Hartz inquired when was Taliesin West first put on the National Register. Mr. Roy

reported it was placed on the National Register of Historic Places on February 19, 1974 and on the National Heritage Site as a landmark in June 1984.

Chair Wimmer stated the staff will be working with the Foundation to develop design guidelines and determine the appropriateness of the site but during this process we need to keep in mind we are dealing with organic architecture so we need to respect that. Mr. Meserve replied staff has discussed with Mr. Roy and the past CEO of the Foundation the evolutionary nature of the complex and that will be recognized in the review procedures and we will be taking a little different process in writing the plan.

Mr. Meserve passed out and reviewed the proposed boundary map staff prepared and sent to the Foundation.

Chair Wimmer inquired about the line going through the building on the map. Mr. Meserve replied the thought was to follow the parcel lines and the Married Student Apartments building straddles a property line and is not considered to be a contributing building to the nomination because it was built recently.

Commissioner Johnson stated she felt the boundary line should include the entire building or the building should be left out because you could run into problems. Chair Wimmer stated we should keep in mind that this is probably the only designation we have in the City that is intended to be changed dramatically over time and at some point that building could cross the threshold and should be a part of the district. He suggested in the narrative describing that building when it becomes eligible it could be added to the collection. Mr. Roy replied the legal description could be written to take care of including or excluding all of the building.

Commissioner Johnson inquired if there was a reason for not using the National Register boundaries. Mr. Meserve explained because we wanted to ensure we did not impact land that we did not need to. Some of the land in the original 1974 boundary has been sold and developed for other uses including Ancala West and Cactus Gates.

Commissioner Winslow stated one of the significant things about the entire complex is the view corridors. Commissioner Howard commented that she was also concerned about the view corridors being preserved because it is a wonderful frame for the buildings and is very necessary.

Commissioner Winslow stated if he were to play devil's advocate and in the future if the Foundation were not as financially strong as it has been in the past, he could see the idea of selling off a piece of land might be appropriate. He further stated as we craft the design guidelines that there could be restrictions to preserve the character of the complex.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that due to the significance of these buildings we should ensure the quality of the design for future additions or alterations.

Commissioner Hartz requested staff provide the Commission with all of the background materials to allow them to have an understanding of how we got to this point, including the two prior nominations and the agreement between the City and the Foundation. Staff agreed to send this information.

Commissioner Johnson stated if they do make changes a qualified archeologist should do a survey and that should be addressed in the guidelines. Mr. Meserve replied under the Archeology Ordinance that would be required for new construction.

Commissioner Gonzales stated one of the most important aspects of this Foundation is the institutional

memory from all of the people who have been here the past 10, 15, 20 years so we need safeguards for when those people are gone.

The Commission concluded that additional discussion of the boundary for Taliesin West historic property was needed and that this topic should be placed on future agendas.

SUGAR BOWL HP PLAN APPROVAL

Mr. Meserve reported the Commission discussed the Sugar Bowl HP plan at the October 28, 2004, meeting. Mr. Meserve dropped a copy of the revised plan off at the Sugar Bowl for Carroll Huntress. The Plan has been revised to incorporate HPC comments and to be formatted like prior approvals. Chair Wimmer requested that in the future staff provide the Commission with a strikeout version of the document. Staff agreed to provide strikeout versions in the future.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he thought there was a restriction on the signage. He further stated that he went over there a week ago he thought the signage had been changed and they added the word fiesta and it didn't blend with the rest of the sign. He reported that they are using aluminum doors that would not meet the design criteria. Chair Wimmer noted that this brings us to an interesting point because we have not approved the recent minor alterations that received a Certificate of No Effect.

Mr. Meserve commented, with regard to the doors for the ice cream parlor expansion, the owner has ordered new ice cream parlor doors to replace the aluminum doors that will be installed soon that are similar to the existing northern entry doors. Chair Wimmer noted it is a work in progress. Commissioner Johnson noted the word fiesta should be individual lettering. Mr. Caferella stated that maybe the lettering is temporary.

Chair Wimmer stated for the record that there is no public present at this meeting to comment on the HP Plan approval.

Commissioner Johnson moved to accept the HP Plan and Design Guidelines for the Sugar Bowl as presented on March 10, 2005. Second by Commissioner Hartz.

Commissioner Winslow stated he felt that the Commission should nudge the building's owner towards replacing the lettering and then he would support the motion.

Commissioner Hartz stated to the best of his memory the revised guidelines are consistent with their discussion in October so he would support the motion.

Chair Wimmer called for the vote. The motion passed unanimously 6-0.

PINK PONY HP PLAN APPROVAL

Mr. Meserve reported the Commission discussed the Pink Pony HP plan at the October 28, 2004, meeting. The Plan has been revised to incorporate HPC comments and to be formatted like prior approvals. Mr. Meserve delivered a copy of the revised plan to the Pink Pony Restaurant.

Commissioner Gonzales stated that he would agree that a strikeout version would be helpful because, if he remembers correctly, there was some discussion regarding retaining the decorative Pink Pony. Chair Wimmer commented that is addressed in Design Guideline No. 11.

Commissioner Johnson stated Design Guideline No. 7 reads: "Repairs to the Pink Pony entry doors should be double-leaf design and decorative wood panels and heavy metal fixtures." She inquired if people will know that is referring to the kachina design on the front doors.

Commissioner Gonzales inquired what would happen if someone else bought this property and no longer wanted the HP designation. Mr. Cafarella replied there is a process to de-list properties.

Chair Wimmer stated for the record that there is no public present at this meeting to comment of the HP Plan approval.

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the Pink Pony HP Plan Design Guidelines with the following modification to No. 7 of the Pink Pony Design Guidelines:

Repairs to the Pink Pony entry doors should retain the southwestern character reinforced with a double-leaf Kachina design door panels and heavy metal entry door fixtures.

Second by Commissioner Winslow and passed unanimously 6-0.

PROPOSAL TO RECOGNIZE HARVEY NORIEGA

Mr. Meserve presented the proposal to recognize Harvey Noriega by naming the livery stables at Brown and 2nd after him. He reported that it has been suggested that since Harvey Noriega is one of the real cowboys of Scottsdale that he should be recognized by naming the livery stable after him. He further reported the Commission has options. The first would be to not get involved because this is not within their purview. The second would be to consider writing a letter of recommendation to the City Council. The third would be to say no comment.

Commissioner Hartz stated that he would disagree that this is not within the Commission's purview because he felt this would be an opportunity to conduct outreach with the community.

Commissioner Winslow stated that he supports endorsing this request.

Commissioner Winslow moved to support the Noriega family on this building as a part of the Commissions outreach. Second by Commissioner Howard and passed unanimously 6-0.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Historic Register

Commissioner Howard stated she did not have anything new to report.

Education Outreach

Commissioner Hartz reported the Education Outreach Committee met on Tuesday and discussed sponsoring an event in May 2005. There is the idea of a downtown walking tour of 9 or 10 sites on the east side of Scottsdale Road. They also discussed concluding the tour with an ice cream social event at the Sugar Bowl noting Mr. Huntress was open to the idea. He responded to questions and comments regarding the tour. Chair Wimmer stated that the Commission should think about their involvement with a business enterprise with a designation because there may be the hint of a quid pro quo.

Commissioner Winslow moved to endorse the concept of the downtown walking tour with the stipulation that the tour is not tied to a specific business. Second by Commissioner Johnson and passed unanimously 6-0.

Commissioner Hartz reported he would keep the Commission informed with the details of the tour.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Meserve reported there would be a workshop for Village Grove 1-6 residents with Don Ryden, architect on Saturday, March 12, 2005 at 10:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m. at the Community Design Studio at 7506 E. Indian School Road.

COMMISSION COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Johnson stated that she would provide the Commission with all the details regarding whom to contact regarding the archives and documentation on Los Arcos Mall.

Chairman Wimmer stated this is Commissioner Johnson's last meeting. He further stated that she has been a great role model for all commissioners'. He thanked her for all of her hard work.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Meserve stated the next meeting would be held on April 14, 2005.

Meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters